Background / Objectives

- The Online Publishers Association (OPA) commissioned Millward Brown IntelliQuest to conduct a Media mix study to understand how online advertising can work in combination with offline advertising.
- Specifically, this research was designed to test recall and memorability of online advertising and television advertising – each alone and in combination - following a single, forced exposure to the ad creative.
- The advertiser used in this test was the United States Air Force.
- Given that this is a high-awareness and high-involvement category, no changes in measurements such as awareness, consideration, and action were expected to be captured in this test of a single exposure to the advertising.
Headlines

- Online ads are memorable long after they are seen
  - Brand ad awareness was significantly higher, and day-after recall of creative was more than double that of the control group.
- Online ads improve the effectiveness of TV ads
  - Those exposed to both online and TV ads were significantly more likely to recall the TV commercial.
- Online advertising is more likely to be seen than TV advertising
  - When an online ad is served the recipient is exposed to the ad. A large portion of TV viewers do not see commercials. Even when instructed to watch an entire program, less than one-third of respondents claim to have watched all of the commercials.
Methodology

Four Cell Experimental Design - Natural Setting

Split into 3 groups
1) TV control: Watched a similar TV show w/o the test TV spot
2) Online control: Went to a web page on NHL.com w/o the test ads
3) TV / Online: Watched the control TV show and went to the control web page

Online panelists were recruited to perform specified tasks on their own

Control

TV Only

Online
Only

Online
+ TV

Went to a web page on ESPN.com containing the test advertising

Watched an episode of “Who Wants to be a Millionaire” containing the test advertising

Watched the test TV episode of and went to the test web page
The Ads
Respondents in the test cells (web only and web + TV) were exposed to an Air Force sponsorship on the NHL “Plays of the Week page” on ESPN.com.
Online Ads

Respondents in the test cells (web only and web + TV) were exposed to an Air Force sponsorship on the NHL “Plays of the Week page” on ESPN.com.

Initiating a video stream brings up a window containing another Air Force badge.
Online Ads

Closer look at the individual units:

(Ad 1)

(Ad 2)

(Ad 3)

(Ad 4)
TV Commercial

Respondents in the test cells (TV only and TV + web) were exposed to the TV commercial below shown during an episode of *Who Wants To Be A Millionaire*. 
Key Findings
The online advertising broke through

Day-after awareness of online Air Force advertising was significantly higher among the test group.

Brand-Linked Ad Awareness of the Air Force Online Ads

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Control (A)</th>
<th>Test Web Only (B)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>21%</td>
<td>38% A</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Weighted Base:
- Control (A): 182
- Test Web Only (B): 136

Q12. Which, if any, of the following United States Armed Services have you seen/heard advertised on the Internet recently?

AB = Significantly different at the 95% confidence level
The TV advertising did not break through

There was no difference in day-after awareness of Air Force advertising on TV...

Brand-Linked Ad Awareness of the Air Force Television Ad

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Control</td>
<td>44%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Test TV Only</td>
<td>45%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Weighted Base:
- Control: 182
- Test TV Only: 136

Q12. Which, if any, of the following United States Armed Services have you seen/heard advertised on television recently?
The TV spot did not break through…nor was there a difference in day-after recall of the specific Air Force ad tested.

Ad Recognition of the Air Force Television Ad

23%

Control: 182

Test TV Only: 136

Q27. Have you seen this television ad?
The TV spot DID break through to those who had also seen the online ads.

There is a synergistic effect when TV and online are used in combination.

### Ad Recognition

- **Television Ads**
  - **CONTROL (a):** 23%
  - **TEST TV Only (b):** 23%
  - **TEST Both (c):** 32%

**Q27. Have you seen this television ad?**

**abc** = Significantly different at the 90% confidence level

Weighted Base:
- CONTROL (a): 182
- TEST TV Only (b): 136
- TEST Both (c): 136

39% increase
Few viewers watch all TV ads…

Less than one-third of respondents in our test cells claimed to have watched all of the commercials.

Q37/38. When watching the (Millionaire/CSI) episode that we asked you to watch, would you say you…?
...unlike online ads, which arrive coupled with content

There is higher recognition of online ads overall (65%), and increased recognition of online ads among those who also saw the ad on TV.

**Ad Recognition**

**Online Ads**

- 65% A

**CONTROL (A)**

- 30%

**TEST Web Only (B)**

- 117% increase

**TEST Both (C)**

- 78% AB

160% increase

Weighted Base:

- CONTROL (A): 182
- TEST Web Only (B): 136
- TEST Both (C): 136

Q20. *Have you seen these online ads?*

ABC = Significantly different at the 95% confidence level
Implications

• This research demonstrates that online advertising performs favorably in a day-after recall test
• Online works well in support of television advertising
• Specifically, an online campaign can increase the impact of a TV spot
• Marketers should have confidence to re-evaluate their media mix to include online as a means of enhancing campaign effectiveness and brand goals
Appendix
Methodology – Qualifying Questions

Respondents were asked questions to help determine whether they completed the tasks they were assigned. These questions are shown below (correct answer is bolded):

- **Control and Test Web:**
  - What sport was featured on the Website we asked you to visit? (Football, Basketball, Baseball, **Hockey**)
  - What was the topic of the poll on the Website? (**Play of the Week**, Playoff match-ups, coaching changes)

- **Control TV:**
  - In the episode of *CSI: Crime Scene Investigation* that we asked you to watch, which of the characters was the murderer? (The lawyer, The wife, **The husband**, The mistress)
  - What was the amount of the ransom? ($500,000; **$1,000,000**; $5,000,000; $20,000,000)

- **Test TV:**
  - In the episode of *Who Wants To Be A Millionaire* that we asked you to watch, how many contestants made it into the “Hot Seat” (that is, they sat across from Regis Philbin and competed for prize money)? (One, Two, **Three**, Four)
  - What kind of episode was it? (Celebrity Edition, **College Edition**, Olympians Edition, A normal episode with ordinary contestants)
Qualified Respondents

The table below details the number of respondents in each quota group who could not correctly answer the task confirmation questions. The bottom row shows the net number who correctly answered the applicable screening questions and who make up the bases used in this report.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number before task confirmation screening:</th>
<th>CONTROL</th>
<th>TEST Web Only</th>
<th>TEST TV Only</th>
<th>TEST Both</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number that did NOT correctly state that...</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The sport featured on Web page was Hockey AND the topic of poll was Play of the Week</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The episode of Millionaire was a College Edition</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In the CSI episode, the husband was the murderer OR the ransom amount was $1,000,000</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**NET QUALIFIED**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CONTROL</th>
<th>TEST Web Only</th>
<th>TEST TV Only</th>
<th>TEST Both</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>166</td>
<td>184</td>
<td>143</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Fielding Summary

Fielding occurred between Tuesday, January 29 – Tuesday, February 5.

The table below details the number of completed surveys in each sample cell along with the sample size to which each was weighted for the purposes of this report.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th># of Completed Surveys</th>
<th>Weighted Base</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Control</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Test Web Only</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Test TV Only</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Test Both</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Cooperation Rate

Control 6%  Test 5%

% that qualified and agreed to complete the survey of those invited

Completion Rate

Control 63%  Test 65%

% that completed survey of those pre-recruited
Sample

Respondent demographics were similar with no significant differences across cells, ensuring a reliable experimental design.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>CONTROL</th>
<th>TEST</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>% A</td>
<td>% B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Gender</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Age</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18-21</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22-24</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Education</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Some College/Associate's Degree</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bachelor's Degree or Higher</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Live at Home with Parents</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Household Income</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Less than $20,000</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$20,000 to $49,999</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$50,000 to $99,999</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$100,000 or more</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prefer not to answer</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Weighted Base</strong></td>
<td>182</td>
<td>409</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>